

AFRICAN UNION

الاتحاد الأفريقي



UNION AFRICAINE

UNIÃO AFRICANA

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

P. O. Box 3243

Telephone: 5517 700

Fax: 5517844

Website: www.au.int

ASSEMBLY OF THE UNION
Thirty-Third Ordinary Session
9-10 February 2020
Addis Ababa, ETHIOPIA

Assembly/AU/12(XXXIII)

Original : English

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE OF 10 HEADS OF STATE AND
GOVERNMENT ON THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS
SECURITY COUNCIL**

**BY H.E. JULIUS MAADA BIO,
PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SIERRA LEONE**

TWENTY-FIRST REPORT OF THE C-10 ON THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS SECURITY COUNCIL

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The African Union Assembly in its decision Assembly/AU/Dec.724 (XXXII) of February 2019, requested the African Union Committee of Ten (C-10) Heads of State and Government on United Nations reforms to continue to intensify its engagement with other Interest Groups and stakeholders with a view to building on progress made in canvassing the Common African Position on the reform of the United Nations Security Council. In view of this, the Assembly encouraged the C-10 to continue holding its High-Level Meetings outside the margins of the Summit of the African Union. Hence the decision of the Coordinator to convene a Ministerial meeting of the C-10 in Dakar, Senegal in January, 2020. The Outcome of the Dakar Meeting is incorporated in this report.

2. The present report is submitted pursuant to the African Union (AU) Summit Decision) Assembly/AU/Dec.724 (XXXII) Doc. Assembly/AU/13(XXXII) during the 32nd Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the African Union (AU) held in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia from 10-11 February, 2019.

3. The report covers the period from 1st March 2019 to 20 January, 2020 and builds on the 20th Report submitted by the C-10 to the 32nd Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the African Union.

4. The present report provides an update on the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) process in the informal plenary of the General Assembly on “the *Question of Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the United Nations Security Council and other matters related to the Council*”, as well as progress made in advancing the Common African Position by the C-10.

5. The report is divided into the following sections: a) recent developments on the reform of the UN Security Council within and outside of the IGN process, b) activities of the C-10, c) observations/analysis of the reform process, and d) conclusions and recommendations.

6. It is important to note that broad support for the Common African Position on United Nations Security Council Reform was recorded in the “Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Paper” produced by the Co-Chairs of the IGN during the 73rd Session of the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA). The Co-Chairs particularly noted that “*there is growing support by Member States for the legitimate aspirations of African countries to play their rightful role on the global stage including through an increased presence in the Security Council, as a priority, to redress the historical injustice against Africa*”.

7. The Committee continued to intensify its engagement with all Interest Groups and United Nations (UN) Member States with a view to further promote, canvass and advocate for the demands of the Common African Position as articulated in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration on the reform of the United Nations Security Council.

II. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS

8. The following are the main developments on the reform of the UN Security Council since the Committees last report to the Assembly in February 2019:

- The 2019 IGN Process and the adoption of the decision to roll over the IGN to the 74th Session.
- Other related developments such as; the General Assembly High Level Debate in September 2019; the Non-aligned Movement Summit in October 2019; the General Debate on Agenda 122 on Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Council held on 25 and 26 November, 2019.
- Activities of the C-10 including meetings with the Presidents of the 73rd and 74th Sessions of the United Nations General Assembly, the Co-Chairs of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on United Nations Security Council Reform, engagement with other Interest Groups, consultative meetings held by His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio with different stakeholders, consultations with the P-5 at the Ambassadorial level in New York and the convening of the Eighth C-10 Ministerial level Meeting in Dakar, Senegal.

a) The Intergovernmental Negotiation Process

9. Following the first meeting of the IGN during the 73rd UNGA Session held on 29-30 January 2019 four additional meetings were held between February and May 2019.

10. The second informal meeting held on 25-26 February focused on three clusters of Security Council reform: i) categories of membership, ii) the question of the veto, and iii) regional representation.

11. UN Member States and Interest Groups, including the C-10, restated their respective positions, which further revealed the entrenched nature of positions with no indication or room for flexibility on key substantive issues.

12. The third meeting which was held on 4th and 5th April 2019, focused on the clusters of the size of an enlarged Security Council and working methods of the Council, and the relationship between the Security Council and the General Assembly. This is

one area where there seems to be some elements of convergence and progress, especially on the working methods and the relationship between the Security Council and the General Assembly.

13. The fourth meeting of the IGN was held on 1st and 2nd May 2019. The meeting deliberated on the interlinkages between the five Clusters of the reform of the Security Council. This was followed by the circulation of the revised version of the “Elements of Commonality and issues for further consideration paper” by the Co-Chairs on 7th May 2019.

14. The 5th IGN meeting was held on 29th and 30th May 2019. Member States discussed the Elements of Commonality Document circulated by the Co-Chairs. There were sharp divisions between Member States and Interest Groups on the content of the document. Some Groups such as the G-4 and L.69 were of the view that the document did not reflect the deliberations of the past meetings, while others like the Uniting for Consensus group (UFC) and some P-5 Members were of the view that the Co-Chairs reflected what was discussed during previous meetings.

15. There was also contention regarding the rollover decision. The G-4 and the L.69 calling for a substantive rollover resolution categorically stated the issues to be discussed in the next UNGA session, including the introduction of Text-Based negotiations. Other groups such as the C-10, the UfC and the P-5 were of the view that a technical rollover with the traditional oral decision will ensure that the IGN discussions continue. The main concern with a substantive resolution was that it would have required a two-thirds vote for the resolution to have been adopted. Should such a resolution fail, the IGN process would have been stalled.

16. The adoption of the decision to roll over the IGN to the 74th Session on the 25th June 2019 was by consensus. The Framework Document, together with the Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Document was rolled over to this current session. It is important to note that the African Group regards the Framework Document produced during the 69th Session as the main reference document of the IGN. It was populated by 120 UN Member States and reflects the core elements of the Common African Position on all the five clusters.

b) Other Related Developments

17. During the General Assembly High-level debate in September 2019, several African Heads of State highlighted the issue of Security Council reform in their statements. They underscored the need for the allocation of two Permanent Seats to Africa in the Permanent Category of the United Nations Security Council, and two additional seats in the Non-permanent Category. However, as compared to High-Level Debate during the 73rd session when over 80 member states highlighted the issue of Security Council reform in their National Statements, only about 60 Member States spoke or mentioned the issue of Security Council reform during the 74th Session.

18. At the 17th NAM Summit, the Heads of State requested for a comprehensive report on the reform of the UN Security Council to be submitted to the 18th NAM Summit. In view thereof, and in line with the last NAM Ministerial meeting held in July 2019, the Permanent Mission of the Arab Republic of Egypt in New York, in its capacity as Coordinator of the NAM working Group for the “Question of Equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Council”, invited Member States of the Movement to share their written inputs to the report.

19. In this regard, Sierra Leone submitted on behalf of the African Union Member States the full text of the Common African Position on United Nations Security Council Reform. Other UN Member States and Interest Groups including Kuwait on behalf of the Arab Group, South Africa, St Vincent and the Grenadines, and India also made inputs to the report. The Arab Republic of Egypt submitted the respective positions and inputs to the 18th NAM summit in October this year with a Note Verbale. It is important to note that NAM Member States expressed different opinions and views on how to proceed with the reform process.

c) General Assembly Debate on Agenda 122 “Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the United Nations Security Council” – 25th November 2019

20. The General Assembly Debate on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Security Council was held on 25th November 2019.

21. Sierra Leone delivered a statement on behalf of the C-10 of the African group. The Statement highlighted elements of the Common African Position and the views and expectations of the African Group for the next session of the IGN.

22. In this regard, it was stated that the Framework Document is regarded as the main reference document that the African Group recognizes, since it contains the positions and proposals of about 120 UN Member States, including interest groups on all the five clusters of the reform process as outlined in Decision 62/557. The statement further noted the overwhelming support expressed for Africa during the last IGN meetings which was not well captured by the Co-Chairs of the 73rd session of the IGN, in their Elements of Commonality and Issues for further consideration document.

23. The C-10 further appealed to the President of the United Nations General Assembly, as guarantor of the process, to use his good offices to appeal to Member States to own the process by actively participating at the IGN meetings.

24. Elements of the C-10 statement was shared with the Member States of the African Group to enable members to develop their own statements and for the group to speak with one voice. Several African Member States took the floor and made statements reaffirming the Common African Position.

25. During the debate, several Member States were of the view that the Security Council risks losing legitimacy unless it is reformed and expanded to include developing States, particularly from Africa. A number of UN Member States and interest groups emphasized that the IGN needs to bear fruit if the United Nations “most important” body is to emerge strong and effective from a bygone era.

26. The President of the United Nations General Assembly Mr. Tijjani Muhammad-Bande of Nigeria, speaking through a representative, opened the debate by underscoring the importance of a non-biased, transparent process. The statement revealed the exceptional complex nature of consultations to identify Co-Chairs of the IGN.

27. Germany’s representative, speaking on behalf of the Group of Four (G4) — Brazil, Germany, India and Japan, said the IGN framework should start text-based negotiations, and called for other procedural matters like attribution of positions, official records as well as webcast of the IGN sessions. The representative of Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, speaking on behalf of the L.69 echoed this aspect of the G4 statement.

28. The representative of Italy, on behalf of the UFC, said there are no procedural shortcuts to consensus on achieving Security Council reform, underlining that text-based negotiations at the current stage will only entrench positions of member states and freeze the status-quo.

29. A number of individual countries opposed to a text-based negotiations at this stage, emphasized that the difficulty facing the reform is due to the fundamental division among member states, rather than the process.

30. Delegates put forward a variety of reform proposals, with many calling for increasing the number of Permanent Council Members beyond the current five (China, France, Russian Federation, United Kingdom, the United States of America). Several African Member States called Africa’s absence from the Council a historic injustice, a sentiment echoed by many. The continent, they believe, must be represented by at least two Permanent Seats and five Non-permanent Seats.

31. Kuwait’s representative, speaking for the Arab Group, advocated for a Permanent Arab Seat, given that several items on the agenda deal with Arab countries.

32. Grenada’s delegate, speaking for the Caribbean Community (CARICOM), called for a rotating Seat for Small Island Developing States. The region’s “small, weak and defenseless States” are particularly sensitive to the need for greater Security Council membership.

33. Veto power wielded by the current P-5 was a major subject of debate, with a number of UN Member States calling for its abolition. Norway’s representative,

speaking for the Nordic countries, said the veto is the main source of the Council's paralysis. Turkey's delegate agreed, saying it is "the reason why the Council should be reformed in the first place".

34. Several delegates defended the veto. The representative of the US reaffirmed its opposition to any alteration of the veto. The Russian Federation's representative said the veto offers an effective check on unwise schemes and its use — or threat thereof — has prevented the United Nations from being drawn into "dubious ventures". Reducing such prerogatives is unacceptable, he said, noting that the Russian Federation is ready to endorse the so-called "interim solution".

III. ACTIVITIES OF THE COMMITTEE OF TEN

35. During the course of the reporting period, the Coordinator, His Excellency Dr. Julius Maada Bio, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone, held consultations with his peers from a number of UN Member States, including African countries, both at the annual UNGA and at various capitals with a view to mustering the necessary political will in favour of Africa, as well as to enhance the cohesiveness and unity of Africa. These consultations were mostly very encouraging in terms of sharing insights and perspectives, opportunities and challenges in promoting and canvassing the Common African Position. The Coordinator will continue to engage at the highest level in order to secure gains made and to explore areas of common interest and to further advance the Common African Position.

36. Furthermore, the C-10 held meetings at the Ambassadorial level in New York with the Uniting for Consensus (UfC) Group, in order to reflect on the major differences between the positions of the two groups and explore means of building convergence. The UfC position is opposed to the expansion of the Permanent Category of the Security Council. The meeting concluded that the IGN on United Nations Security Council reform is the appropriate forum to discuss the issue of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Council. Also, the two groups were able to find common ground on the veto with both groups advocating for its abolition, and agreed to continue engaging each other during the 74th UNGA Session.

37. The C-10 also held consultations with the L-69 at the Ambassadorial between February and May 2019. Discussions centered on the need to build on areas of commonality and moving the process forward. The L.69 supported the Common African Position during the IGN meetings and called for the proper reflection of the African Position in the Co-Chairs document.

38. The C-10 and P-5 Ambassadors in New York held a joint consultative meeting on 20th May, 2019 with a view to further advance the Common African Position and exploring ways to generate the necessary political will. The meeting, which was the first of its kind was convened at the behest of the Permanent Mission of the People's Republic of China to the UN.

39. The C-10 Ambassadors also met with the Presidents of the 73rd Session of the General Assembly and with the Co-Chairs of the IGN, Ambassadors Lana Nusseibeh and Christian Braun of the United Arab Emirates and Luxembourg respectively, to discuss concerns relative to the revised elements of commonality document. The PGA was very supportive of Africa and by all indications was instrumental in getting the Co-Chairs to better reflect some aspects of the Common African Position in their Paper.

40. The C-10 Ambassadors also actively participated in the African Group of Ambassadors Retreat in April 2019 where they presented the current state of play on the reform of the United Nations Security Council. In addition, the C-10 briefed the African Ambassadors before the final meeting of the IGN which led to their overwhelming participation in the Final IGN meeting.

41. The C-10 Ambassadors met on 28th October, 2019. They discussed the following issues: Meeting with the President of the 74th Session of the General Assembly, the general debate on the “Question of Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Security Council”, the recently held C-10 Ministerial Meeting in Dakar Senegal, preparations for the next African Union Summit and preparations for the next IGN Session.

42. The C-10 met with the President of the 74th General Assembly (PGA) H.E. Mr. Tijjani Muhamad-Bande of Nigeria on the 28th November 2019. The C-10 congratulated the PGA on his appointment and pledged to support his efforts with regards Security Council Reform. The C-10 further engaged the PGA on his plans for the upcoming IGN session including the appointment of the current Co-Chairs to facilitate the process.

43. The PGA expressed caution, intimating the fact that the reform will not be achieved overnight. He was however hopeful that there will be some progress during the 74th Session. He promised to appoint Co-Chairs who were fair-minded and are knowledgeable about the reform process. The PGA also committed to consulting with the UN Member States on how the next IGN Session should progress.

44. Following the appointment of the Co-Chairs of the IGN on United Nations Security Council Reform for the 74th Session of the General Assembly by the PGA, in the persons of Ambassadors Lana Nusseibeh (reappointed) and Joanna Wronecka of the United Arab Emirates and Poland respectively, on 4th December 2019, the C-10 Ambassadors held a consultative meeting with them on 16th December 2019.

45. The C-10 Ambassadors congratulated the Co-Chairs on their appointment and assured them of the support of the African Group during the IGN session. The C-10 Ambassadors further advised that the Co-Chairs should endeavour to agree at the outset with Member States, before the commencement of the IGN, on the timeline of meetings, the number of meetings to be held during the session and the early circulation of documents ahead of the IGN meetings.

46. The C-10 Ambassadors also underscored the need for the Co-Chairs to be transparent and to endeavour to fully reflect the positions and proposals of all interest and regional groups, and individual UN Member States.

47. The Co-Chairs assured the C-10 Ambassadors that they will be transparent and open in their engagement with Member States. Regarding the timeline of meetings, they stated that they would consult with all other groups and Member States. They were of the view that it will be very hard to hold meetings after the traditional end date of June, as a result of pending meetings related to the 75th Anniversary of the United Nations and other UN processes.

The Eighth C-10 Ministerial Meeting - Dakar, Senegal 12-13 January 2020

48. Pursuant to the Decision of the 32nd Ordinary Session of the African Union Assembly of Heads of State and Government on the reform of the United Nations Security Council, that the African Union Committee of Ten Heads of State on the United Nations Reform (C-10) should continue to hold its High-Level Meetings outside the margins of the African Union Assembly, the Government of the Republic of Sierra Leone, in collaboration with the Government of the Republic of Senegal, co-hosted the Eighth Ministerial Meeting of the Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government (C-10) in Dakar, Senegal from 12 -13 January, 2020. The Meeting was attended by all C-10 Member States.

49. The aims and objectives of the Ministerial Meeting were:

- a) To examine recent developments and progress made on the issue of UN Security Council reform, including the outcome of the Meetings of the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) during the 73rd Session of the United Nations General Assembly in New York, and the C-10's engagements in canvassing and promoting the Common African Position.
- b) To share perspectives on ways to further advance the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration.
- c) To explore means to further enhance the cohesiveness and unity of the African Union Member States on the reform of the UN Security Council.
- d) To provide further guidance to the C-10 Permanent Missions in New York and Addis Ababa on substantive and procedural issues.

50. The Ministers reflected on the reform process and took note of the various positions on the reform of the UN Security Council, and their wide-ranging divergences on both substantive issues of the UN Member States/interest groups and on procedural matters.

51. The Eighth Ministerial Meeting was preceded by a Meeting of the Senior Officials and Permanent Representatives from Addis Ababa and New York.

52. Speaking on behalf of the C-10 Coordinator, **H.E. Julius Maada Bio**, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone, H.E. Nabeela Tunis thanked **H.E. President Macky Sall**, the Government and People of Senegal for graciously hosting the Eighth Ministerial meeting of the committee. She heartily commended the African Union Member States, in particular, the C-10 Heads of State and Government, for their relentless commitment to canvassing, promoting and advancing the Common African Position, as well as for upholding its exactness; and encouraged the C-10 to redouble efforts and commitments to redress the persistent historical injustice done to Africa.

53. Opening the meeting, His Excellency Macky Sall, President of the Republic of Senegal warmly welcomed the C-10 Ministers and Permanent Representatives, expressed sincere appreciation to His Excellency Mr. Julius Maada Bio, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone, and Coordinator of the C-10 for his time and efforts spent in coordinating the Committee.

54. Setting the tone for the meeting, His Excellency Mr. Macky Sall remarked that with the largest membership in the United Nations (54 Member States), Africa has every legitimacy to claim Permanent Representation in the UN Security Council. Moreover, African issues occupy the largest part of the agenda of the Security Council. It is therefore needless to say that African problems cannot be solved without Africans. He underscored that more equitable representation would give the UN Security Council an added measure of authority and legitimacy as the guarantor of our collective security. It is therefore fair and legitimate to make the UN Security Council more inclusive in its composition and more democratic in its functioning for a better global governance.

55. In this connection, His Excellency President Macky Sall encouraged the C-10 to pursue its mandate by ensuring solidarity, cohesion and group discipline, while duly continuing its interaction with other UN Member States and interest Groups. Furthermore, it is important to continue to stress the need to preserve inclusiveness and transparency in the negotiations process.

56. Addressing substantive issues, His Excellency Macky Sall recalled that it is also right that all members of a reformed UN Security Council should enjoy the same prerogatives, including the right of veto, in line with the Common African Position. He also cautioned against the so-called intermediate or transitional approach that would only lead to a hybrid composition of the Council, something that might lead to a dysfunctional UN Security Council.

57. His Excellency President Macky Sall ended his remarks by urging the Committee to keep the same spirit of solidarity and cohesion during the upcoming IGN sessions. His Excellency President Macky Sall ended his remarks with the hope that the deliberations of the Ministers will help to guide the C-10 Heads of State and Government to submit a report to the AU Summit in February, 2020.

58. The full text of the Outcome of the Ministerial Meeting is annexed to this report.

IV. OBSERVATIONS AND ANALYSIS

59. There is no gainsaying that the Common African Position on United Nations Security Council Reform has continuously garnered support at the IGN. Every Interest Group and several UN Member States participating in the IGN have stated their support for the Common African Position, though some of these support are not fully in compliance with the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration.

60. For instance the Uniting For Consensus Group (UfC) have consistently expressed support for the African demand to rectify the historical injustice done to the African continent, but they do not support expansion of the Permanent Membership of the United Nations Security Council, which is a key African demand. They prefer expansion in the Non-permanent Category with new longer term seats in addition to the existing Non-permanent Seats, which will be based on the principle of election and rotation. In addition, the UfC does not support extension of the veto to new Permanent members. Conversely though, the UfC supports the retaining of veto rights by the current five Permanent Members.

61. The G-4 (Japan, Germany, India and Brazil), despite their call for expansion of the Permanent Category, hold the view that the new Permanent Members of the Security Council should not immediately have the veto right, which they propose should be discussed at a later date preferably 15 years after the reform would have taken place. They are also of the view that Permanent members represent themselves and not their regions, which is a key departure from the African position on regional representation that calls for Africa's representatives to be chosen by the African Union.

62. Also, all Members of the P-5 and a number of other UN Member States have indicated support for enhanced African representation and inclusion of Africa in the Permanent category but with no clear indication of support for the extension of the veto.

63. Another important observation is that there are some Member States and Interest Groups such as the G4 and the L.69 who are calling for changes in the format of the IGN. The suggested changes, include having the IGN session on webcast, institutionalizing the documents of the IGN meetings and having meetings throughout the year in the IGN instead of ending the session in June.

64. From a neutral perspective, it will be difficult to webcast the IGN session or create meeting records since it is an informal plenary of the General Assembly. No other informal discussions in the General Assembly have ever been webcasted or recorded, as they are all done in a closed format, according to the rules of procedure of the General Assembly. In addition, having IGN meetings throughout the year will have logistical complications relative to the available meagre resources.

65. The issue of Text-Based Negotiation is also one area where Member States are divided, especially on procedural matters. Some Member States and Interest Groups, including the G.4 and L.69 are of the view that the IGN is now ripe for Text-Based Negotiations. In effect, they want the IGN to focus on a single document and negotiate on the specific elements of the document.

66. However, there are some other Member States including some P-5 members and the UfC who are of the view that Text-Based negotiations are premature. These Member States and Interest Groups indicate that the divergences in views and positions are so wide ranging that it will be counterproductive to engage in a single text without first engaging in a constructive manner that will lead to a point of achieving the widest possible acceptance on five the issues outlined in Decision 62/557.

67. The C-10 also observed that there are two documents currently being discussed at the IGN. Thus, the question is which of these documents can be used as a negotiating text?

68. The Framework document of 2015 is considered by the C-10 as the main reference document of the IGN as it encapsulates the positions and proposals of about 120 Member States of the United Nations, including the Common Africa position. The concern, however, is that about 70 Member States including Interest Groups, did not participate in populating the Framework document. Some Member States and Interest groups sent letters in their respective national capacities to the then Chair of the IGN indicating their objection to the process of launching the Framework document, while at the same time referencing their positions made earlier to the compilation text that had evolved from compilation to a 3rd revision of the text. The Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration document of 2019 on the other hand, does not fully incorporate all the positions and proposals of Member States and thus, cannot be considered as a document for negotiation.

69. This state of affairs poses a fundamental challenge to the process of engaging in Text-Based Negotiation at this point in time, as there is no document that commands sufficient support to serve as the basis of a text-based negotiations.

70. While momentum continues to build around the need to redress the historical injustice suffered by the African continent, there has not been any substantive shift in positions of UN Member States and Interest Groups.

71. There is broad support for the enlargement of the UN Security Council and for its working methods to be improved.

72. The contentious issues, which include, the size of a future UN Security Council, categories of membership, regional representation, and the question of the veto, should be the focus of future engagements with other interest groups.

73. The opposition to the extension of the veto has the potential to maintain the status quo without addressing fundamental principles such as equity, common justice, legitimacy, transparency and accountability.

74. A number of UN Member States acknowledge the need and importance to reform UN Security Council to reflect the current geopolitical realities, in particular, an enhanced African representation, which validates Africa's legitimate claim and therefore a big stakeholder in the reform process.

75. The proposal by some UN Member States for an interim/transitional/intermediary category of membership or Permanent membership with deferred veto of the reformed UN Security Council, is not in compliance with the Common African Position as it relates to "categories of membership" cluster, and also not a comprehensive approach as outlined in Decision 62/557.

76. The continual divergence of the various positions and proposals of UN Member States, which make it difficult to generate consensus on the key issues.

77. It should be noted that achieving consensus on substantive issues that paves the way for the Common African Position should be the first step towards producing a text that should be agreeable to all UN Member States.

78. The IGN is a Member State driven process, and given the interconnectedness of the five key clusters outlined in Decision 62/557, the principle of "Nothing is agreed until everything is agreed" should be strictly adhered to by UN Member States and Interest Groups. It is therefore critical for UN Member States to engage in transparent and inclusive discussions that would engender tangible progress.

V. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

79. All Member States view the reform of the UN Security Council as vital to the effectiveness and legitimacy of its decisions. Reform of the Security Council is therefore a priority to all UN Member States.

80. The C-10 acknowledges with appreciation the indication of wide support by UN Member States, including other Interest Groups, for the Common African Position; and therefore, urges that such expressions be translated into tangible support for the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration.

81. Against the background of the legitimacy and support that Africa continues to garner at the ongoing IGN, the C-10 is of the view that the Common African Position as enshrined in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration is the only viable option for Africa.

82. Africa should therefore remain cohesive on all aspects of the reform process, continue to speak with one voice in unity of purpose until the demands of the Common African Position articulated in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration are achieved.

83. It is only through the achievement of the Common African Position enunciated in the Ezulwini consensus and the Sirte Declaration that the historical injustice the continent continues to suffer could be redressed.

84. In this regard, the C-10 reiterates the need for all African Union Member States to include the Common African Position on the reform of the UN Security Council in their respective Foreign Policy priorities.

85. Given the present state of play of the United Nations Security Council reform process, the C-10 is of the view that the IGN established by Decision 62/557 is the most appropriate and legitimate forum for the reform of the UN Security Council, and emphasizes on the inter-linkages of the five key negotiable clusters under discussion at the on-going IGN in New York.

86. The C-10 therefore reaffirms that Africa should continue to reject any intermediate, transitional or intermediary approaches to the reform of the UN Security Council as they seriously undermine the Common African Position.

87. Given the divergence and nuances in positions with no sign of flexibility from some Interest Groups, it is important to stress that the integrity of the Common African Position is defended with a view to ensuring its exactness, as well as to ensure that it is neither compromised nor disadvantaged at the ongoing IGN meetings in New York.

88. In addition, African Member States should be further encouraged to withdraw from other Interest Groups to enhance the cohesiveness of the Common African Position.

89. The C-10 should continue to engage with the African Group in New York and Addis Ababa, all Interest Groups and UN Member States, and to regularly review the "Common Language" for future inclusion in the statements of Heads of State and Government of AU Member States during the high-level sessions of the UN General Assembly and other multilateral platforms.

90. The C-10 should further engage with the Permanent Members of the Security Council at the highest level to follow up and build on previous engagements aimed at garnering the necessary political will in support of the Common African Position.

91. Africa should not allow itself to be caught up in procedural issues at the IGN. The focus should be on the substantive issues, especially the five clusters of the reform, and how support for the Common African position can be further strengthened to the point of achieving the mandate given to the C-10.

92. The Committee reiterates support for the July 2015 letter by the President of the UN General Assembly circulating the text and its annex, and underscores the imperative for the UN Security Council to be enlarged in both the Permanent and Non-permanent Categories, to allow African representation in the Permanent Category with all the prerogatives and privileges, including the right of veto as the current Permanent Members, and address Africa's under-representation in the Non-permanent Category as well as, equitable representation of all regions, improvement of the Security Council's working methods and its relationship with the General Assembly.

93. In view of the foregoing, it is recommended that IGN meetings during the current 74th UNGA Session be dedicated to in-depth and constructive discussion of the documents referenced in the General Assembly roll over decision adopted on 25th June 2019, in particular, the positions of and proposals made by Member States, reflected in the text and its annex circulated on 31 July 2015. It will, in this regard, be useful if the next meetings of the IGN are focused on the following:

- a) General issues with specific focus on the need to correct the historical injustice done to Africa as well as, the principles for reform of the Security Council. This would provide the opportunity to review the process and reinforce the imperative need to rectify the historical injustice done to Africa. An in-depth discussion of regional representation, especially the case for Africa is essential.
- b) The working methods of the Security Council, in particular, how it impacts on the work of the UN, especially the inequity in the composition of the Council, as well as the disadvantaged situation of the Non-permanent seats, in terms of institutional knowledge, and decision making. This will provide an opportunity for the C-10 to argue the case for the allocation of Permanent Seats to Africa.
- c) A meeting dedicated to the status of the various IGN documents and what needs to be done going forward.
- d) A meeting focused on a summary of the above meetings with an outline of the way forward.

Assembly/AU/12(XXXIII)Annex
Original : English

**OUTCOME DOCUMENT OF THE MINISTERIAL-LEVEL MEETING OF
THE AFRICAN COMMITTEE OF TEN (C-10) ON THE REFORM OF THE
UNITED NATIONS SECURITY COUNCIL.**

**DAKAR, SENEGAL
12TH – 13TH JANUARY, 2020**

I. CONTEXT

1. Pursuant to the Decision of the 32nd Ordinary Session of the African Union assembly of Heads of State and Government on the reform of the United Nations Security Council, that the African Union Committee of Ten Heads of State on the United Nations Reform (C-10) should continue to hold its High-Level Meetings outside the margins of the African Union Assembly, the Government of the Republic of Sierra Leone, in collaboration with the Government of the Republic of Senegal, co-hosted the Eighth Ministerial Meeting of the Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government (C-10) in Dakar, Senegal from 12-13 January, 2020.

2. The aims and objectives of the Ministerial Meeting were:

- a. To examine recent developments and progress made on the issue of UN Security Council Reform, including the outcome of the Meetings of the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) during the 73rd Session of the United Nations General Assembly in New York, and the C-10's engagements in canvassing and promoting the Common African Position;
- b. To share perspectives on ways to further advance the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration;
- c. To explore means to further enhance the cohesiveness and unity of the African Union Member States on the reform of the UN Security Council;
- d. To provide further guidance to the C-10 Permanent Missions in New York and Addis Ababa on substantive and procedural issues;

3. The Ministers also reflected on the reform process and took note of the various positions on the reform of the UN Security Council, and their wide-ranging divergences on both substantive issues of the UN Member States/interest groups and on procedural matters.

II. ATTENDANCE

4. The Ministerial Meeting was attended by the C-10 Member States as follows:

- i. H.E. Nabeela Tunis, Minister of Foreign Affairs and international Cooperation, Republic of Sierra Leone.
- ii. H.E. Monica Juma, Cabinet Secretary for Foreign Affairs and International Trade, Republic of Kenya.
- iii. H.E. Jean-Claude Gakosso, Minister of Foreign Affairs, cooperation and Congolese Abroad, Republic of Congo.
- iv. H.E. Sam Kutesa, Minister of Foreign Affairs, Republic of Uganda.

- v. H.E. Amadou Ba, Minister of Foreign Affairs and Senegalese Abroad, Republic of Senegal.
- vi. H.E. Christine Hoebes, Deputy Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, Republic of Namibia.
- vii. H.E. Rachid Bladhane, Secretary of State in Charge of National Community and Skills Abroad. Representing the Minister of Foreign Affairs, People's Democratic Republic of Algeria.
- viii. H.E. Matias Nguema Mba Medja, Secretary General, representing the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of equatorial Guinea.
- ix. H.E. Joumoa Ibrahim Amer, Permanent Representative of the State of Libya to the African Union. Representing the Minister of foreign Affairs.
- x. H.E. Emmanuel Mwamba, permanent Representative of the Republic of Zambia to the African Union. Representing the Minister of foreign Affairs.

5. H.E. Madame Cessouma Minata Samate, Commissioner for Political Affairs representing the Chairperson of the African Union Commission was also in attendance.

III. OPENING CEREMONY

6. The Eighth Ministerial Meeting was preceded by a Meeting of the Senior Officials and Permanent Representatives from Addis Ababa and New York.

7. Addressing the meeting, both Ministers. Their Excellencies Amadou Ba and Nabeela Tunis thanked the Permanent Representatives of the C-10 for their hard work and commitment to canvassing, advancing and defending the Common African Position, and entreated them to do justice to the aims and objectives of the Ministerial Meeting.

8. Speaking on behalf of the C-10 Coordinator, H.E. Julius Maada Bio, president of the Republic of Sierra Leone, H.E. Nabeela Tunis thanked H.E. President Macky Sall, the Government and People of Senegal for graciously hosting the Eighth Ministerial meeting of the committee. She heartily commended the African Union Member States, in particular, the C-10 Heads of State and Government, for their relentless commitment to canvassing, promoting and advancing the Common African Position, as well as for upholding its exactness: and encouraged the C-10 to redouble efforts and commitments to redress the persistent historical injustice done to Africa.

9. Opening the meeting, His Excellency Macky Sall, President of the Republic of Senegal warmly welcomed the C-10 Ministers and Permanent Representatives, expressed sincere appreciation to H.E Julius Maada Bio, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone. Coordinator of the C-10 for his time and efforts spent in coordinating the Committee.

10. Setting the tone for the meeting H.E Macky Sall made the following remarks:

- a. With the largest membership in the United Nations (54 Member States), Africa has every legitimacy to claim Permanent Representation in the UN Security Council. Moreover, African issues occupy the largest part of the agenda of a Security Council. It is therefore needless to say that African problems cannot be solved without Africans.
- b. More equitable representation would give the UN Security Council an added measure of authority and legitimacy as the guarantor of our collective security. It is therefore fair and legitimate to make the UN Security Council more inclusive in its composition and more democratic in its functioning for a better global governance.
- c. In this connection, the C-10 should pursue its mandate by ensuring solidity, cohesion and group discipline, while duly continuing its interaction with other UN Member States and interest Groups. Furthermore, it is important to continue to stress the need to preserve inclusiveness and transparency in the negotiations process.
- d. Addressing substantive issues, H.E. Macky Sall recalled that it is also right that all members of a reformed UN Security Council should enjoy the same prerogatives, including the right of veto, in line with the Common African Position. He also cautioned against the so-called intermediate or transitional approach that would only lead to a hybrid composition of the Council, something that might lead to a dysfunctional UN Security Council.
- e. His Excellency President Macky Sall ended his remarks by urging the Committee to keep the same spirit of solidarity and cohesion in the upcoming IGN session.
- f. His Excellency President Macky Sall ended his remarks with the hope that the deliberations of the Ministers will help to guide the C-10 Heads of State and Government to submit a report to the AU Summit in February, 2020.

IV. OUTCOME OF DELIBERATIONS

11. The Ministers deliberated on the present state of play on the reform of the UN Security Council and reflected on the following:

- The progress made in canvassing, promoting and defending the Common African Position during the past 73rd Session of the UN General Assembly, and what should be done to further build on gains made so far.
- The present state of affairs at the intergovernmental negotiations (IGN) in New York, including General Assembly oral roll-over decision adopted on 29 June 2019, which inter-alia rolled over the “revised elements of commonality and issues for further consideration” paper produced by the previous Co-chairs of the IGN, as well as the positions of and proposals made by UN Member States, reflected in the text and its annex circulated on 31 July 2015, and the ‘elements of commonality and issues for further

consideration circulated on 7 June 2019 to help inform the future work of the IGN; and

- Challenges going forward.

a) The Common African Position

12. Against the background of the present state of play of the IGN process, in particular, the legitimacy and support that Africa continues to garner, the Ministers:

- i. Reiterated that the Common African Position as enshrined in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration is the only acceptable and viable option for Africa.
- ii. Also, reiterated the importance for African countries to stay united on the reform of the UN Security Council, to speak with one voice and to unequivocally support the Common African Position, which calls for the allocation of two seats in the Permanent Category with all its prerogatives and privileges including the right of veto, and two additional seats in the Non-permanent category of the Security Council.
- iii. Noted the divergence of position of UN Member States on both substantive and procedural matter on UN Security Council reform, and underscored therefore, the need for Africa to stay the course and to continue canvassing other UN Member States and Interest Groups for more concrete support in favour of the common African Position.
- iv. Encouraged the C-10 and all African Union Member States to continue to engage other UN Member States and mobilize support in favour of the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration.
- v. Reaffirmed that Decision 648 of the 29 Ordinary Session of the African Union Assembly of July 2017, requesting African countries to withdraw membership from all other Interest Groups, should be implemented.

b) The Intergovernmental negotiations

13. In relation to the on-going IGN, the Ministers reiterated the inevitability of the reform of reflect the current geopolitical realities, in particular, the need to correct the imbalance of the UN security Council, and in that regard, made the following observations:

- i. The IGN in the informal plenary on the “Question of Equitable representation on and Increase in the Membership of the Security Council and other related Matters” continue to enjoy broad support from UN Member States as the most acceptable forum to deliberate on reforming the UN Security Council.
- ii. All Member States view the reform of the UN Security Council as vital to the effectiveness and legitimacy of its decisions. Reform of the Security Council is therefore a priority to all UN Security States.

- iii. The Committee acknowledges with appreciation the indication of wide support by UN Member States, including other Interest Groups, for the Common African Position. Therefore, urges that such expression be translated into tangible support for the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration.
- iv. While momentum continues to build around the need to redress the historical injustice suffered by the African continent, there has not been any substantive shift in positions of UN Member States and Interest Groups.
- v. There is broad support for the enlargement of the UN Security Council and for its working methods to be improved.
- vi. The contentious issues, which include, the size of a future UN Security Council categories of membership, regional representation, and the question of the veto, should be the focus of future engagements with other interest groups.
- vii. The opposition to the extension of the veto has the potential to maintain the status quo without addressing fundamental principles such as equity, common justice, legitimacy, transparency and accountability.
- viii. A member of UN Member States acknowledge the need and importance to reform UN Security Council to reflect the current geopolitical realities, in particular, and enhanced African representation, which validates Africa's legitimate claim and therefore a big stakeholder in the reform process.
- ix. The proposal by some UN Member States for an interim/transitional/intermediary category of membership of the reformed UN Security Council, is not in compliance with the Common Africa Position as it relates to "categories of membership" cluster, and also not a comprehensive approach as outlined in Decision 62/557.
- x. The continual divergence of the various positions and proposals of UN Member States, which make it difficult to generate consensus on the key issues.
- xi. That achieving consensus on substantive issues should be the first step towards producing a text that should be agreeable to all UN Member States.
- xii. The IGN is a Member State driven process, and given the interconnectedness of the five key clusters outlined in Decision 62/557, the principle of "Nothing is agreed until everything is agreed" should be strictly adhered to by UN Member States and interest Groups. It is therefore critical for UN Member States to engage in transparent and inclusive discussions that would engender tangible progress.
- xiii. The Committee reiterates support for the July 2015 letter by the President of the UN General Assembly circulating the text and its annex.

V. CONCLUSION AND ADDITION RECOMMENDATIONS

14. Upon through consideration of the present state of play of the IGN, as well as the progress made to canvass, promote and advance the Common African Position, the following recommendations are made:

- i. Reaffirms the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration as the only viable option for Africa to successfully achieve its objectives;
- ii. Reiterates the need for all African Union Member States to include the Common African Position on the reform of the UN Security Council in their respective Foreign Policy priorities;
- iii. Underscores the need to regularly review the “Common Language” for future inclusion in the statements of Head of state and Government of AU member States during the high-level sessions of the UN General Assembly and other multilateral platforms;
- iv. Reaffirms that the IGN established by Decision 62/557 remains to be the legitimate forum for the reform of the UN Security Council, and emphasizes on the inter-linkages of the five key negotiable cluster under discussion at the on-going IGN in New York;
- v. Also reaffirms that Africa should continue to reject any intermediate, transitional or intermediary approaches to the reform of the UN Security Council as they seriously undermine the Common African Position;
- vi. Stresses that the Common African Position should neither be compromised nor disadvantaged at the ongoing IGN given the divergence and nuances in positions with no sign of flexibility from some interest Groups;
- vii. Underscores the imperative for the UN Security Council to be enlarged in both the Permanent and Non-permanent categories to allow African representation in the Permanent category with all the prerogative and privileges, including the right of veto as the current Permanent members, and address Africa’s under-representation in the Non-permanent category as well as, equitable representation of all regions, improvement of the Security Council’s working methods and its relationship with the General Assembly;
- viii. Reiterates the need for the C-10 to continue to do outreach to the P-5 following on previous outreach at the levels of Foreign Ministers and Ambassadors;

- ix. Underlines the need for C-10 Capitals and Mission in Addis Ababa and New York, to intensify, through an effective communication strategy, outreach meetings with all stakeholders to galvanize support for the Common African Position;
- x. Recommends that IGN meetings during the current 74th (UNGA) Session be dedicated to in-depth and constructive discussion of the documents referenced in the General Assembly roll over decision adopted on 25th June 2019, in particular, the position of the proposals made by member States, reflected in the text and its annex circulated on 31 July 2015. It will, in this regard, be useful if the next meetings of the IGN are focused on the following:
 - a) General issues with specific focus on the need to correct the historical injustice done to Africa as well as, the principles for reform of the Security Council. This would provide the opportunity to review the process and reinforce the imperative need to rectify the historical injustice done to Africa. An in-depth discussion of regional representation, especially the case for Africa is essential.
 - b) The working methods of the Security Council, in particular, how it impacts on the work of the UN, especially the inequity in the composition of the Council as well as the disadvantaged situation of the Non-permanent seats, in terms of institutional knowledge, and decision making. This will provide an opportunity for the C_10 to argue the case for the allocation of Permanent Seats to Africa.
 - c) A meeting dedicated to the status of the various IGN documents and what needs to be done going forward.
 - d) A meeting focused on a summary of the above meetings with an outline of the way forward.

VI. APPRECIATED

1. The participants at the Ministerial Meeting expressed their deep gratitude to His Excellency Mr. Macky Sall, President of the Republic of Senegal, the Government and People of Senegal for the warm and fraternal welcome extended to them as well as the excellent facilities made available to them to ensure the smooth conduct of their deliberations.
2. The Participants further commended the Coordinator, His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio for his strong leadership and commitment in spearheading the pursuit of the C-10 mandate and advancing the objectives of the Common African Position the reform of the United Nations Security Council.
3. The Ministers expressed appreciation for the support of the African Union Assembly to facilitate the work of the Committee of Ten Heads of State

and Government on UN Reforms, and also commended the African Union Commission for facilitating the Ministerial Meeting.

4. The Ministers welcomed the offer by Uganda to host the next meeting at a date to be determined through consultation with the C-10 Coordinator.

DRAFT
DECISION ON THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS SECURITY COUNCIL
Doc. Assembly/AU/12(XXXIII)

The Assembly,

1. **ADOPTS** the Twenty-first Report of the Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government on the Reform of the United Nations Security Council, by His Excellency Mr. Julius Maada Bio, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone;
2. **RECALLS DECISIONS** ASSEMBLY/AU/Dec.564(XXIV), Assembly/AU/Dec.573(XXIII), Ext/Assembly/AU/Dec.1(IV) Assembly/AU/Decl.2(V), Assembly/AU/Dec.617(XXVII), Assembly/AU/Dec.724(XXXII);
3. **TAKES NOTE** of the high-level meetings of the Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government, including the Eighth Ministerial Meeting held in Dakar, Senegal in January 2020 and the high-level outreach with the P-5 and other stakeholders on the reform of the United Nations Security Council;
4. **ACKNOWLEDGES WITH APPRECIATION** the progress made by the Committee of Ten in promoting and canvassing support for the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the 2005 Sirte Declaration on the United Nations Security Council Reform;
5. **WELCOMES** in that regard, the growing acceptance of the legitimacy of the Common African Position on the reform of the United Nations Security Council;
6. **ENCOURAGES** the Committee to continue holding its high-level and outreach meetings with a view to further intensify efforts aimed at promoting and canvassing the Common African Position on the reform of the United Nations Security Council;
7. **REAFFIRMS** that the Common African Position espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration, shall continue to serve as the only viable option that reflects Africa's legitimate right and aspiration to rectify, inter alia, the historical injustice endured by the Continent; as the only viable option for Africa's full representation at the UN Security Council;
8. **REITERATES** that full representation of Africa in the United Nations Security Council means:
 - i) Not less than two (02) Permanent seats with all the prerogatives and privileges of Permanent membership including the right of veto;
 - ii) Five (05) Non-permanent seats;
 - iii) That the African Union reserves the right to select its representatives for election to the UN Security Council to act in its name and on its behalf;

9. **ALSO REITERATES** that even though Africa is opposed, in principle, to the veto, it is of the view that so long as it exists, and as a matter of common justice, it should be made available to all Permanent Members of the UN Security Council;
10. **FURTHER REITERATES** the firm commitment to preserve Africa's unity and solidarity on all aspects of the United Nations Security Council reform process, including participation within and outside the intergovernmental negotiations, **AND** to continue to speak cohesively with one voice in unity of purpose on all aspects of the reform process;
11. In that regard, **REITERATES** that African Union Member States in New York with dual membership, should withdraw such membership from all other Interest Groups, in order to further consolidate the Common African Position as contained in the Ezulwini consensus and the Sirte Declaration;
12. **REQUESTS**
 - i) The Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government to continue to intensify its engagement at the highest level with other Interest and Regional Groups and key stakeholders, including the Permanent Five Members of the UN Security Council, with a view to building on progress made in advancing and canvassing the Common African Position contained in the Ezulwini consensus and Sirte Declaration on the reform of United Nations Security Council;
 - ii) All African Union Member States, to reflect in their respective National statements at the opening of the 75th Session of the United Nations General Assembly in September 2020, a concise common language to promote and canvass the Common African Position, and to reiterate the call for a comprehensive reform of the United Nations Security Council;
 - iii) African Union Member States to include the issue of the United Nations Security Council reform among their foreign policy priorities in their engagements with non-African partners, in particular, the need to correct without further delay, the historical injustice that the African continent continues to endure;
13. **DECIDES** to include an allocation in the commission's Budget for the purpose of funding and facilitating the activities of the Committee of Ten on UN reforms;
14. **ALSO DECIDES** that the Committee of Ten remains seized of its mandate until Africa achieves its objectives on the reform of the United Nations Security Council, and **REQUESTS** the Committee to present a report to the 34th Ordinary Session of the Assembly.

AFRICAN UNION UNION AFRICAINE

African Union Common Repository

<http://archives.au.int>

Organs

Assembly Collection

2020-02-10

Report of the Committee of 10 Heads of State and Government on the Reform of the United Nations Security Council by H.E. Julius Maada Bio, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone

African Union

DCMP

<https://archives.au.int/handle/123456789/8976>

Downloaded from African Union Common Repository