

AFRICAN UNION

الاتحاد الأفريقي



UNION AFRICAINE

UNIÃO AFRICANA

P. O. Box 3243, Addis Ababa, ETHIOPIA Tel.: Tel: +251-115- 517 700 Fax: +251-115- 517844 / 5182523
Website: www.au.int

ASSEMBLY OF THE UNION
Thirty-Second Ordinary Session
10 – 11 February 2019
Addis Ababa, ETHIOPIA

Assembly/AU/13(XXXII)
Original : English

**REPORT OF H.E. JULIUS MAADA BIO, PRESIDENT OF THE
REPUBLIC OF SIERRA LEONE CHAIRPERSON OF THE COMMITTEE
OF TEN HEADS OF STATE AND GOVERNMENT ON
THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS SECURITY COUNCIL (C10)**

**DRAFT REPORT OF H.E. JULIUS MAADA BIO, PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF
SIERRA LEONE CHAIRPERSON OF THE COMMITTEE OF TEN HEADS OF STATE
AND GOVERNMENT ON THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS SECURITY
COUNCIL (C10)**

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The present report is submitted pursuant to the African Union (AU) Summit Decision Assembly/AU/Dec. (XXIX) Doc. Assembly/AU/9(XXIX) during the 29th Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the African Union (AU) held in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia from 3rd - 4th July 2017.
2. The report covers the period from 6th July 2018 to 30th January 2019 and builds on the 19th Report submitted by the Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government on the reform of the United Nations Security Council (C-10) to the 29th Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the African Union and the briefing by the Coordinator, **His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio** during the 31st Ordinary Session of the Assembly held in June 2018 in Nouakchott, Mauritania.
3. The present report provides an update on the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) process in the informal plenary of the General Assembly on “the *Question of Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the United Nations Security Council and other matters related to the Council*”, as well as progress made in advancing the Common African Position by the AU Committee of Ten on the reform of the United Nations Security Council. The report is divided into the following sections: a) recent developments on the reform of the UN Security Council within the Intergovernmental Negotiations process, b) activities of the African Union Committee of Ten, c) observations/analysis of the reform process, and d) conclusions and recommendations.
4. The Committee’s outreach engagements continue to gradually build on the support for the Common African Position. This is demonstrated by the number of Member States that have added their voices in support of the Common African Position. In particular, the call for an equitable representation of Africa in the United Nations Security Council.
5. It is obvious that the Common African Position on the reform of the UN Security Council enjoy broad support across the United Nations membership, and remains unchallenged in its claim to redress the historical injustice of not being represented in the Permanent category and under-represented in the Non-Permanent category of the Security Council.
6. This broad support was recorded in the “Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Paper” produced by the Co-Chairs of the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) during the 72nd Session of the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA). The Co-Chairs particularly noted that “Member States

acknowledged the legitimate aspirations of African countries to play their rightful role on the global stage”

7. The Common African Position espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration remain viable for a comprehensive reform of the Security Council on all the five clusters outlined in General Assembly Decision 62/557, namely: a) categories of membership; b) the question of the veto; c) regional representation; d) size of an enlarged security Council and working methods of the Council; and relationship between the Council and the General Assembly. This is in accord with the overall objective of making the Security Council more representative, accountable, transparent, effective and efficient, and thus, enhance the legitimacy and implementation of its decisions.

8. The Committee will continue to intensify its engagement with all Interest Groups, Regional Groupings and individual Member States with a view to building on gains made thus far, in advancing the demands of the Common African Position on the reform of the United Nations Security Council.

9. It is in the light of achieving this objective that the Committee convened a Ministerial Meeting in Freetown from 14 to 15 December, 2018. The Outcome of the Freetown Meeting will be a useful guide to the Committee’s work going forward.

10. The continuous building of momentum around the Common African Position is encouraging. This momentum should be viewed as progress that should be built upon and translated into tangible and concrete support, especially in the face of varied and seemingly competing positions that remain divergent on models of reform, as well as procedural matters that continue to challenge the overall progress on consensus building.

11. The unity and cohesiveness of Africa is crucial as the C-10 continue to engage with other Interest Groups, regional groupings and individual Member States of the UN. Africa should in this regard continue to speak with one voice on both substantive and procedural matters in further advancing the Common African Position with a view to garnering more support that would engender decisive progress. The quest to redress the historical injustice the continent continues to suffer, as well as making the Security Council more broadly representative, democratic, legitimate, transparent and accountable should be a matter of importance and an essential element of the foreign policy objectives of all AU Member States.

II. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS ON THE REFORM OF THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL

12. Developments on the reform of the UN Security Council since the Committee’s briefing during the Assembly of the African Union Summit held in Nouakchott, Mauritania in July 2018, include:

- a) The General Debate of Heads of State and Government held in September 2018;
- b) The appointment of a new Co-Chair of the IGN, H.E. Mr. Christian Braun, Permanent Representative of Luxembourg to the United Nations and the reappointment of H.E. Mrs. Lana Nusseibeh, Permanent Representative of the United Arab Emirates to the United Nations respectively, by H.E. Mrs. Maria Fernanda Espinoza Garces, President of the 73rd Session of the United Nations General Assembly;
- c) The General Assembly plenary meeting on agenda item 124 on “*the Question of Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the Security Council*” held on 20th November 2018; and activities of the C-10 including, outreach to some Interest Groups;
- d) Ministerial Level Consultative meeting of the C-10 held on 14-15 December 2018; and
- e) Consultation with the Co-Chairs on the resumption of the (IGN) Meetings for the 73rd UNGA Session.

a) The Intergovernmental Negotiation process

13. Following five intensive meetings of the IGN from February to May 2018, the General Assembly on 29 June, 2018 adopted the Oral Decision to roll-over the Intergovernmental Negotiations on “*the Question of Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Security Council*” to the 73rd UNGA Session.

14. The roll-over Decision, inter alia, called for an immediate continuation of the IGN in the informal plenary during the 73rd Session of the UN General Assembly. This was another significant manifestation of the acceptance of the IGN as the appropriate forum to continue with discussion on the reform of the Security Council. At the end of the IGN meetings in June 2018, the Co-Chairs presented the “Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Paper”, which was rolled over together with the positions and proposals made by Member States reflected in the text and its annex circulated on 31st July 2015.

15. The C-10 of the AU Member States highlighted the inaccurate and inadequate reflection of the Common African Position in the “Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Paper”. Interest Groups and individual Member States expressed their views with regards to the reform of the Security Council and also about the commonalities document.

16. It should be noted that genuine interest to continue with the IGN was demonstrated by a consensus General Assembly roll-over decision 72/557 of 29th June

2018, which inter alia called for an immediate continuation of the IGN in the informal plenary during the 73rd session of the United Nations General Assembly.

17. By a letter dated 21st November 2018, H.E. Mrs. Maria Fernanda Espinoza Garcés, President of the 73rd Session of the UNGA, appointed H.E. Mr. Christian Braun, Permanent Representative of Luxembourg to the United Nations and re-appointed H.E. Mrs. Lana Nusseibeh, Permanent Representative of the United Arab Emirates to the United Nations respectively, as Co-Chairs of the IGN on “the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Security Council”.

18. The Co-Chairs of the IGN commenced consultative meetings with Member States in mid-December 2018 with a view to discuss their calendar of work for the 73rd Session and to hear the perspectives of Member States and Interest Groups. At the consultative meeting between the C-10 and the Co-Chairs held on 20th December 2018, the Co-Chairs and the President of the General Assembly proposed to start the IGN meetings at the end of January 2019. This was to enable more meetings of the IGN to take place during the present session. To that end, the Co-Chairs scheduled the first meeting of the IGN to be held on 29th - 30th January 2019.

19. In line with the views emanating from the Co-Chairs’ consultative meetings with Member States and Interest Groups on both process and substance, and given the membership driven nature of the process, the Co-Chairs by a letter dated 18th January, 2018, invited Member States to share their views during the first meeting on ways in which work can be carried on with a view to building on the progress achieved so far. The meeting was divided into a plenary segment and an interactive session.

20. At the opening of the first IGN for the 73rd Session of the UNGA, the President of the General Assembly, opined that “*the Question of Equitable representation on and increase in the Membership of the Security Council and Matters related to Council*” has been on the agenda of the General Assembly for over two decades, and remains to be urgent. The President of the General Assembly also recalled the repeated calls by Member States for a Security Council that reflects current political realities, as well as the need for the Council to be more representative, efficient and transparent in order to enhance its effectiveness and the legitimacy and implementation of its decisions. Despite the sensitivities involved and the differences that persist, she called for progress this year which should be achieved through goodwill and compromise, with political will, courage and resolve, as well as flexibility and constructive engagement. Member States were, therefore, encouraged to continue with interaction between the main negotiating blocs, with a view to seeking further areas of convergence and to reassess their positions. The President of the General Assembly assured Member States that she will exert every effort to facilitate their work, and to enable an open and sincere discussion in seeking to advance the shared aspiration of reforming the Security Council.

21. A number of Member States and Interest Groups participated in the meeting. However, there was no fundamental change in their respective positions on both substance and process. The importance and urgency to reform the Security Council was reechoed by all Member States and Interest Groups.

22. During the course of the debate, Member States and Interest Groups unanimously underscored the need to adhere to the principles outlined in Decision 62/557, and related General Assembly Decisions, which, inter alia, calls for a Membership-driven process of the IGN. In that regard, IGN was unanimously acknowledged as the appropriate forum for the discussion on “*the Question of Equitable representation on and increase in the Membership of the Security Council and Matters related to Council*”.

23. Some Member States and Interest Groups, including the G-4 (Brazil, Germany, India and Japan), the L-69 Group (comprising of about 40 countries with overlapping membership, with Saint Vincent and the Grenadines as Focal Point), the Community of Caribbean States (CARICOM) reiterated the call for text-based negotiations, as well as the need to attribute positions and proposals in the “Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Paper” to the respective proponents in a transparent manner. These Interest Groups also expressed the view that the current IGN Session should build on the Paper produced during the 72nd Session. The G-4 specifically called for the normalization of the IGN process, with a workable text to serve as a basis for Member States’ reflections. Some P-5 members, the Arab Group, some African countries and the UfC do not, however, support the launching of text-based negotiations without first narrowing down on the areas of divergence on substantive positions, as well as on the overall principles of the reform.

24. A number of Member States, including the C-10 of the African Union Member States, however, objected to any approach that would exclude other relevant documents, in particular, the positions and proposals made by Member States, reflected in the text and its annex circulated on 31 July 2015 also referred to as the Framework Document, and the “Elements of Convergence” circulated on 12 July 2016. This is against the background that the text and its annex circulated on 31 July 2015 is the main document that contains the positions and proposals made by about 120 Member States.

25. Different proposals were suggested with regards to the workplan of the IGN for the 73rd Session. Some Member States called for more meetings that would focus on building on the “*Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration Paper*” of the 72nd Session. The C-10 proposed to schedule five meetings that will focus on an in-depth discussion of regional representation, especially the case for Africa; the Working Methods of the Security Council, in particular, how it impacts on the work of the UN; a review of the various IGN documents and what needs to be done going forward; and at the end of the above meetings, a dedicated meeting to summarize the discussions. There were also suggestions to organize a retreat outside the UN with a view to having more informal discussions in an informal environment.

26. The C-10 also reiterated the reaffirmation of the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration as the means of correcting the imbalance of the present configuration of the Security Council, which perpetuates the injustice that the African region endures. The Common African Position was highlighted, especially the need to allocate to Africa two Permanent seats with all the attributes of the current Permanent members, and two additional Non-permanent seats, to address the non-representation of Africa in the Permanent category, and its under-representation in the Non-permanent category respectively.

27. Several Member States and Interest Groups, including the P-5, the CARICOM, the L-69, the G-4, and the Nordic countries expressed support for Africa's inclusion in the Permanent category of the Security Council, as well as the need for additional seats in the Non-permanent category. It should, however be noted that CARICOM, the L-69 and France were very clear on extending the veto to new Permanent Members. France is, however, also supportive of the proposal to curtail the use of the Veto, especially in cases of mass atrocities.

28. Even though the P-5 do not have a unified position on the overall reform process, they are, however, apparently united in their call for a modest expansion, and they reject the proposal to abolish the Veto.

29. The Uniting for Consensus group (UfC), with core membership of about 13 countries, and Italy as Focal Point, remains opposed to adding new Permanent seats. This group is supported by about 30 other countries. During the General Assembly Plenary Debate held in November 2018 on agenda item 124, the UfC, proposed longer term seats with possibility for immediate re-election, as opposed to Permanent seats. They also proposed for an increase of the two-term Non-permanent seats. In view of this, the UfC suggested in-depth discussion of the connection between all five clusters. In particular, the implications of categories of membership for an inclusive and accountable Security Council; implications of regional representation for a democratic and legitimate Security Council; and implications of the question of the Veto for an efficient Security council. The UfC proposal is in principle, opposed to allocating Permanent seats for Africa.

30. The interactive segment of the meeting held on 30 January 2019 was very informative. Member States were required to respond to a set of questions prepared by the Co-Chairs of the IGN. It provided an opportunity for Member States to share perspectives on structuring the meetings of the IGN during this 73rd Session, with a view to identifying further convergences in positions on regional representation, categories of membership, and the question of the veto; means of carrying forward the mandate of the IGN in line with previous years' General Assembly Decisions, while taking into account Member States' diverging views; explore room for improving upon existing work related to the working methods and size of an enlarged Security Council; and in addition to the interactive dialogue, to suggest other ways the Co-Chairs could accumulate consensus among Member States in accordance with Decision 62/557.

b) *The General Debate of Heads of State and Government Held in September 2018*

31. The President of the 73rd Session of the General Assembly noted in her synopsis of the General Debate during the General Assembly held from 24th – 28th September 2018, that about 80 world leaders reflecting on the achievements of the UN thus far, also called for urgent progress on reforms deemed necessary for the future success of the Organization. In particular, several Heads of State and Government called for an enlargement of the Security Council with the addition of Permanent seats for Africa.

32. In line with the outcome of the C-10 Malabo Consultative Summit, which was subsequently adopted by the AU Assembly in July 2017, the Committee transmitted a “Common Language” for inclusion in the statements of all AU Member States during the 73rd UNGA General Debate of Heads of State and Government.

33. In that regard, in his address to the General Assembly in September 2018, the Coordinator, His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio highlighted the need to rectify the historical injustice done to Africa, and reiterated the call for Africa to be equitably represented in both the Permanent and Non-permanent categories of the Security Council, as outlined in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration.

c) *The General Assembly Plenary Debate on Agenda Item 124 “Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the United Nations Security Council” – 21st November 2018*

34. The plenary debate of the General Assembly on Agenda 124 on “*the Question of Equitable Representation on and Increase in the Membership of the Security Council and other Matters relating to the Security Council*” was held on 20th November 2018.

35. In her opening remarks, the President of the General Assembly, (PGA) stressed that the Security Council must adapt to new political realities, with increased representation to boost its legitimacy and the implementation of its decisions. She lamented that, even though the debate on the issue of increased Security Council membership has been on the Assembly’s agenda for two decades, no consensus has been reached on how to reform the Council. While pledging full support for Security Council reform, the PGA recognized that the issue is complex and closely intertwined with efforts to ensure international peace and security.

36. The debate revealed the continual division among Member States on an ideal solution, agreeable to all. A number of Member States called for broadening the number of Permanent members beyond the current five (China, France, Russian Federation, United Kingdom, and United States), as well as curtailing the use of the Veto power, especially in circumstances including genocide and crime against humanity.

37. The C-10 of the African Group spotlighted that most issues discussed in the 15-member organ are related to the African continent. In that regard, the C-10 reiterated that the 54 African countries must be involved in decisions concerning not only international peace and security, but matters that directly concern the continent. The need to redress Africa's Non-representation in the Permanent Category and Under-representation in the Non-Permanent Category of the Security Council, by allocating no less than two Permanent seats, including the veto power, if it continues to exist, and five Non-permanent seats, was underscored. The C-10 urged Member States to translate the widespread support for the Common African Position into a tangible outcome this time around. An outcome that will redress the long-standing historical injustice.

38. The debate provided another opportunity for Member States to share their respective views on the reform process and substantive issues. There is no doubt that all Member States are in support of necessary reforms, including the expansion of the Security Council to accommodate representation of developing countries, in particular, an enhanced African representation. Some Member States also expressed support for the G-4 (Brazil, Germany, India and Japan). It should be noted that the Uniting for Consensus (UfC) members with Italy as its focal point, are in principle, opposed to the aspirations of the G-4.

39. A number of Member States pointed out that despite agreement on expanding the number of Non-permanent seats, questions remain concerning the expansion of Permanent seats, as well as the size of an enlarged Security Council.

40. The issue of the Veto also remains contentious, with divisions on whether to abolish it, extend or not to extend it to new Permanent Members, and or curtail its use in certain circumstances.

III. ACTIVITIES OF THE AFRICAN UNION COMMITTEE OF TEN ON THE REFORM OF THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL

41. During the reporting period, the C-10 Permanent Representatives in New York held consultations with various stakeholders/Interest Groups relative to advancing the Common African Position, as well as on the overall progress and process of the IGN.

42. Consultations held with two of the G-4 members give a sense of their desire to review their position on the Veto. The G-4 is also desirous to focus on the "Revised Elements of Commonality Paper" as the main document of discussion in the next IGN session.

43. Consultation was also held with Italy, the focal point for the UfC. The thrust of the consultation was to exchange views on the respective positions of Africa and the UfC. The UfC believes that allocating 6 longer term Non-permanent seats to Africa is a pragmatic approach to correcting the current imbalance in the Security Council. This proposal is, however, not in compliance with the Common African Position.

44. The C-10 also had an outreach engagement with three of the P-5 Member States. There seems to be no outright opposition to an enhanced African representation. The issues that persist are the naming of Africa's candidate Countries, opposition to the abolition of the Veto and financial contributions to the United Nations.

45. These engagements are contributing towards building on the support that the Common African Position continues to garner.

46. Guided by the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration, and following the adoption of Decision Assembly/AU/Dec. 648(XXIX), including, its annexure containing the Outcome of the Malabo Consultative Summit of May 2017, and the outcome of the C-10 Consultative meeting held on the margins of the 31st Ordinary Session of the Assembly held in Nouakchott, in June 2018, **His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio**, Coordinator of the C-10, requested the Ministers of Foreign Affairs of the C-10 to meet in Freetown, Sierra Leone from 14 to 15 December, 2018.

47. The Meeting considered the Report of the Retreat of the Permanent Representatives held in New York in April 2018, and also examined the present state of play of the IGN on the reform of the UN Security Council.

48. The Ministerial Meeting was preceded by a Meeting of the Senior Officials from C-10 Capitals and Permanent Representatives from Addis Ababa and New York.

49. Setting the tone for the meeting, the Coordinator, **His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio** called upon the Ministers to examine critical questions, including what progress had been achieved at the IGN; Africa's legitimate claim to Permanent membership in relation to its population size of more than 1.2 billion people; what pathways can be used to further the aims and objectives of the Common African Position; and what strategies can the C-10 employ to engage with other regional groups. The Coordinator further questioned the bases for excluding Africa from the Permanent membership of the Security Council, given that Africa contributed immensely to the victory achieved by the current Permanent members during the Second World War. **His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio** ended his remarks with the hope that the deliberations of the Ministers will help to guide the C-10 Heads of State and Government to submit a report to the AU Summit in February, 2019.

50. The Ministers of the C-10 reflected on the achievements of the Committee in popularizing the Common African Position enunciated in the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration, including the gains made to canvass, promote, advance and defend the Common African Position.

51. The Ministers also reflected on the present state of play of the ongoing IGN on the reform of the UN Security Council, and the geopolitical realities. In that regard, the Ministers emphasized Africa's crucial role in the reform process, and the need to stay the course in the pursuit of Africa's legitimate claims.

52. The following emerging issues were also discussed by the Ministers:

- i) The slow pace of the UN Security Council Reform Process;
- ii) Calls for text-based negotiations to commence in the IGN process;
- iii) The issue of Dual Membership with other Interest Groups that could undermine the Common African Position;
- iv) Regional Representation- concern on how African seats will be apportioned vis-a-vis the current sovereign representation of the current P-5;
- v) The need to intensify Outreach with other Interest Groups and the P-5;
- vi) Insistence by some P-5 for financial contribution as one of the preconditions for the Permanent Category Membership;
- vii) Timeliness of sharing information with African Union Member States.

53. Following deliberations on the above emerging issues, the Ministers made a number of recommendations for consideration by the C-10 Heads of State and Government.

54. The Ministers concluded the Meeting with the consideration and adoption of the Report of the Retreat of the Ambassadors and Permanent Representatives held in New York, U.S.A, from 27 to 29 April 2018. The report of the retreat includes the Aide Memoire for outreach with the P-5 at the highest political level, the Matrix of Planned Activities of the C-10, and the Common Language circulated for inclusion into the statements of the African countries during the 73rd UNGA Session. The Report aims at further advancing the Common African Position, as well as to serve as a guide and roadmap for engagement with the P-5 at the highest political level, enhanced and intensive engagement with other Interest Groups and Member States, and a more structured collaboration with the African Union Member States.

55. Following the C-10 Ministerial Meeting, **His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio**, Coordinator of the C-10, transmitted a correspondence to the C-10 Heads of State and Government, informing them about the outcome of the Meeting. In particular, the recommendations and documents produced to guide the work of the C-10. In relation to a proposal to hold a High-Level conference during the 74th UNGA Session, **His Excellency President Julius Maada Bio**, proposed that, as a first step, an all-present C-10 Summit was required to fully reflect on progress and challenges to the Common African Position, deliberate on the outcome of the outreach with the P-5, and explore means to further advance the Common African Position. To that end, he proposed the holding of a C-10 Summit on the margins of the 74th UNGA Session.

56. The Permanent Representative of Sierra Leone, in his capacity as the Coordinating Permanent Representative of the C-10 in New York, briefed the African Group on 16th January 2019 on the outcome of the Ministerial Meeting. The briefing was

focused mainly on issues that were considered as challenges to advancing the Common African Position, including the approach to the IGN process vis-a-vis moving to text-based negotiations; the perceived division within Africa arising from the dual membership of some Member states in other Interest Groups; the slow pace of the IGN process; and the need to intensify outreach with the P-5 and other regional and Interest Groups.

57. Views expressed in relation to text-based negotiations were mixed. Some were of the view that Africa should tactically adapt its approach in order to influence text-based negotiations and not to shy away from it. This was, however, countered with the need for clarity on what “text” or “texts” from among all existing texts would be the basis of the negotiations. In this regard, the group was cautioned against the risk of submitting the Common African Position as the basis for negotiations. It was concluded that a greater clarity was required, as well as guidance on the way forward.

58. There were two views on the impact of dual membership of African countries in other Interest Groups. The first was its effect on weakening efforts to advance the Common African Position, and the second, was its benefits in relation with a particular Interest Group, the L-69, in terms of amplifying the Common African Position.

59. On the 31st January 2018 The African Group of Ambassadors/Permanent Representatives in New York had a briefing session with the Ambassador of the Russian Federation to the United Nations, H.E. Mr. Vassily Nebenzia to discuss among other things, the issue of United Nations Security Council Reform.

60. The Ambassador of Russia informed the African Group Ambassadors that the Russian Federation supports the Ezulwini Consensus and the Common African Position as a whole. He also stated that the Russian Federation is not against the extension of the veto. Russia was, however, against abolition of the veto.

61. In regards to the process, H.E. Mr. Vassily Nebenzia stated that Russia was against text-based Negotiations for reasons that there was no consensus among Member States whether to engage in text-based negotiations. He observed that some African Member States were in favour of text-based negotiations while others were not. He was hopeful that Africa will stay united on this issue.

IV. OBSERVATIONS

62. The Intergovernmental Negotiations in the informal plenary on the “question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and related matters” continues to enjoy broad support from UN Member States as the most acceptable forum to deliberate on reforming the UN Security Council.

63. All Member States view the reform of the Security Council as vital to the effectiveness and legitimacy of the Security Council’s decisions. Reform of the Security Council is, therefore, a priority to Member States.

64. Member States, including the P5, are of the view that the Security Council should be reformed to represent the present global political realities. In this regard, Africa has a genuine case and, therefore, a big stakeholder in the process.

65. However, since the adoption of Decision 62/557 in September 2008, the reform process has forged on, albeit cautiously and at a slow pace; but delegations have remained consistently engaged in the process. Convergences, divergences and areas of concern with regards to the proposals and positions of the various Interest Groups and Member States, have been stated and restated during the multiple exchanges held so far.

66. Clearly, there is broad support in favour of enlargement of the size of the Security Council and for its working methods to be improved.

67. The Common African Position continues to garner support in the IGN process. This should be leveraged on for tangible deliverables through engagement with the respective Capitals of the major Interest Groups and the P-5 Member States.

68. A number of Member States, including the five Permanent members, have been consistent in expressing support for an enhanced African Representation in the Security Council but are opposed to either abolishing the veto, extending it or curtailing its use. They also continue to call for Africa to name its candidates.

69. The Member States of the Caribbean Community (CARICOM) and the L-69 group, (a grouping of States from different regions and a number of them with dual membership) fully endorse the Common African Position. The difference between the two is that the CARICOM position on the reform of the UN Security Council has the endorsement of its Heads of State and Government and acknowledges and support the Common African Position in its entirety.

70. A major challenge facing the reform process is the competing different models of reform. While there seems to be a growing convergence for expansion in both categories of the Security Council, the different propositions on this model of expansion make it difficult to reach a consensus.

71. For instance, the G-4's proposal to expand the Security Council in both categories but prefer to postpone discussions on the issue of the Veto to a review period of 15 years, is fundamentally different from the Common African Position. The G-4 proposal is essentially one of Permanent Membership without Veto, which is the same as a Non-permanent seat on a permanent basis.

72. Furthermore, questions relating to country-specific seats versus regional representation persists. The clusters dealing with categories of membership and regional representation also remain contentious.

- 73.** Another area of divergence among Member States is the proposal to enlarge the Security Council in only the Non-permanent category. The UFC model of expansion in the Non-permanent category only with longer-term seats is one of such proposals.
- 74.** These varied and divergent positions on both the process and substantive issues create a situation of a seeming impasse, which makes it difficult to make tangible progress on the reform of the Security Council at the IGN.
- 75.** The necessary political will is therefore required to distinguish Africa's unique situation and special needs, meet the demands of the Ezulwini Consensus and Sirte Declaration, and adhere to the commitments made by World leaders during the 2005 World Summit relating to the reform of the UN Security Council.
- 76.** There is call by some Interest Groups for a re-launch of text-based negotiation. However, the issue remains contentious among Member States.
- 77.** The first attempt with text-based negotiation was the submission of positions and proposals by Member States in 2009 under the guidance of Ambassador Zahir Tanin, the then facilitator/Chair of the IGN. The compiled text of 180 pages gradually evolved from first to third revisions with 37 pages. The document was however considered by the G-4 to be unwieldy for negotiation and due to lots of pressure, the process of further streamlining the document was eventually abandoned during the 69th UNGA Session in 2015. The Second attempt was the introduction of the Framework Document during the 69th UN General Assembly Session. The Positions and proposals made by Member States were reflected in the text, and its annex that was circulated on 31st July, 2015.
- 78.** The main challenge with text-based negotiation is the lack of political will by Member States to demonstrate flexibility by shifting from their respective positions. Given Africa's unique situation as the only region without any Permanent seats and also under-represented in the Non-permanent category, it is a paradox that some of the Member States are calling for Africa to be flexible.
- 79.** While the momentum continues to build around the need to redress the historical injustice suffered by the African continent, there has not been any substantial shift on both the process of the reform and substantive proposals and positions of Member States.
- 80.** The IGN process has so far assisted Member States to have a better insight into the various positions in terms of identifying areas of convergence as well as areas of divergence. This can be further built upon by the C-10 as a useful tool to engage other Member States.
- 81.** Mustering the necessary political will to move the process forward is indispensable for future progress of the Intergovernmental Negotiation.

82. The proposed consultations with the P-5 at the level of Heads of State and Government might provide the C-10 with ideas on the next steps, as well as hopefully assist in moving the process forward.

V. CONCLUSION

83. The progress made in advancing the Common African position should be built upon through intensified and constructive engagement with all other Interest Groups and individual Member States, with a view to taking advantage of the existing commonalities and finding ways of narrowing down areas of divergence.

84. Africa should remain cohesive on all aspects of the reform process, continue to speak with one voice in unity of purpose, until the demands of the Common African Position are achieved. African countries should, in this regard, incorporate the Common African Position and highlight it in their respective Foreign Policies.

85. To further advance the Common Africa Position, in line with Africa's unique situation, the C-10 Heads of State and Government should consider to commence outreach with their P-5 counterparts ahead of the next African Union Summit.

86. The Common African Position should continue to reject any Intermediate, Transitional or Intermediary Approach on the grounds that they out-rightly contradict the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration.

87. Africa may consider supporting the call for a Non-permanent seat for Small Island States, in view of the strong historical and concrete support by the CARICOM Heads of State and Government for the Common African Position.

88. In line with the Decisions of the AU Assembly, and in the pursuit of achieving its Common Position on the reform of the UN Security Council, African countries with dual membership should withdraw their membership from other interest Groups engaged in the IGN Process.

89. It is critical that African countries are guided on the issue of text-based negotiations so that they speak with one voice during the IGN process. The Common Africa Position as espoused in the Ezulwini and Sirte Declaration on the reform of the UN Security Council should, however, not be allowed to be the basis of any negotiation.

90. The C-10 planned activities, as well as the Aide Memoire for engagement with the P-5 at the highest political level and the strategy for engagement, adopted in Freetown, Sierra Leone at the C-10 Ministerial meeting, provides elements that could guide the work of the C-10.

DRAFT
DECISION ON THE REFORM OF THE UNITED NATIONS SECURITY COUNCIL
Doc. Assembly/AU/13(XXXII)

The Assembly,

1. **TAKES NOTE** of the 20th Report of the Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government on the Reform of the United Nations Security Council;
2. **REITERATES** the need to reform the United Nations to conform to the present geopolitical realities, in particular, the need to address Africa's non-representation in the Permanent category and its under-representation in the Non-permanent category of the United Nations Security Council;
3. **ACKNOWLEDGES WITH APPRECIATION** the progress made by the Committee of Ten in advocating and canvassing support for the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the 2005 Sirte Declaration on the United Nations Security Council Reform;
4. **WELCOMES** in that regard, the growing acceptance of the legitimacy of the Common African Position on the reform of the United Nations Security Council;
5. **ALSO WELCOMES** the full endorsement for the Common African Position as espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration by a number of Interest Groups and Member States from across all regions during the Intergovernmental Negotiations at the United Nations in 2018;
6. **FURTHER WELCOMES** with APPRECIATES the endorsement of the Common African Position by the Heads of State and Government of the Caribbean Community (CARICOM),
7. **REAFFIRMS** its firm commitment to the Common African Position espoused in the Ezulwini Consensus and the Sirte Declaration as the only viable option for Africa's full representation at the UN Security Council;
8. **REITERATES** that full representation of Africa in the United Nations Security Council means:
 - i) Not less than two (02) Permanent seats with all the prerogatives and privileges of Permanent membership including the right of veto;
 - ii) Five (05) Non-permanent seats;
 - iii) That the African Union reserves the right to select its representatives for election to the UN Security Council to act in its name and on its behalf;

9. REQUESTS

- i) The Committee of Ten Heads of State and Government to continue to reach out at the highest political levels, including with the five Permanent members of the Security Council, with a view to advancing the Common African Position on the reform of the United Nations Security Council;
 - ii) The Committee of Ten to also continue to intensify its engagement with other Interest and Regional Groups and stakeholders with a view to building on progress made in advancing the Common African Position on the reform of United Nations Security Council; in this regard, **ENCOURAGES** the Committee of Ten to continue holding its High-Level Meetings outside the margins of the Summit of the African Union;
 - iii) All African Union Member States, to reflect in their respective National statements at the opening of the 74th Session of the United Nations General Assembly in September 2019, the concise common language to advance the Common African Position, and to reiterate the call for a comprehensive reform of the United Nations Security Council;
 - iv) African Union Member States to include the issue of the United Nations Security Council reform among their foreign policy priorities in their engagements with non-African partners, in particular, the need to correct without further delay, the historical injustice that the African continent continues to endure;
10. **REITERATES** the firm commitment to preserve Africa's unity and solidarity on all aspects of the United Nations Security Council reform process, including participation within and outside the intergovernmental negotiations, **AND** to continue to speak cohesively with one voice in unity of purpose on all aspects of the reform process;
11. In that regard, **REITERATES** that the C-10 continue to liaise with other African Union Member States in New York and Addis Ababa, through regular briefing on updates on matters related to the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the reform of the United Nations Security Council, including the activities of the C-10.
12. **REITERATES** that the African Union Member States in New York with dual membership should withdraw such membership from all other Interest Groups, in order to further consolidate the Common African Position as contained in the Ezulwini consensus and the Sirte Declaration;
13. **DECIDES** that Common African position on the reform of the UN Security Council shall be a strategic item on the Assembly's Agenda and Workplan, and this regard, **REQUESTS** the Commission to continue to facilitate the work of the Committee of Ten;
14. **ALSO DECIDES** that the Committee of Ten remains seized of its mandate until Africa achieves its objectives on the reform of the United Nations Security Council.

2019-02-11

Report of H.E. Julius Maada Bio, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone Chairperson of the Committee of ten Heads of State and Government on the Reform of the United Nations Security Council (C10)

African Union

DCMP

<https://archives.au.int/handle/123456789/9001>

Downloaded from African Union Common Repository